

## **Research Regarding the Lineage of Bhikshuni Ordination**

March 16 – 18, 2006, the Committee of Western Bhikshunis met at Sravasti Abbey to research the possibility of the introduction of the bhikshuni ordination into the Tibetan Buddhist tradition. This paper was written in response to two papers by Ven. Tashi Tsering of the Dept. of Religion and Culture in Dharamsala in which he raised several questions. It was also written in preparation for a meeting of Tibetan Vinaya scholars which the DRC is organizing and at which some members of the CWB will be present. The CWB was formed after His Holiness the Dalai Lama said to Bhikshuni Jampa Tsedroen in August, 2005, that the Western bhikshunis should be active in researching bhikshuni ordination and practice and making contact with monks and nuns of our own and other Buddhist traditions who are interested in this.

**RESEARCH REGARDING THE LINEAGE OF BHIKṢUṆĪ ORDINATION**  
**A Response to Necessary Research Regarding the Lineage of Bhikṣuṇī Vinaya**  
by the Committee of Western Bhikṣuṇīs

**A. Question: Is it possible to establish full *bhikṣuṇī* ordination in accordance with the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya tradition that flourished in Tibet?**

Yes, the *bhikṣuṇī* ordination could be performed in one of two ways:

**1. *Bhikṣuṇī* Ordination by Mūlasarvāstivāda *Bhikṣus* Alone**

The Buddha allowed *bhikṣus* to ordain *bhikṣuṇīs* as shown by the following Vinaya quotations:

**a. Pāli Theravāda Vinaya**

Mahāprajāptī was ordained by receiving the eight *gurudharmas* from the Buddha. Mahāprajāptī then asked the Buddha how her 500 women followers should be ordained and the Buddha said, “O monks, I allow *bhikkhunīs* to receive the *upasampadā* from *bhikkhus*.”(1)

**b. Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya**

**Tibetan**

The first *gurudharma* is, “O Ānanda, after women have received ordination (*pravrajya*) and full ordination (*upasampadā*) from the *bhikṣus*, they should thoroughly understand the matter of being a *bhikṣuṇī*. O Ānanda, in this regard, so that women may avoid faults and not transgress, I announce this as the first *gurudharma*; women should follow this training throughout their lives.”(2)

**Sanskrit**

Same as above.(3)

**Chinese**

Same as above.(4)

**c. Chinese Dharmagupta Vinaya**

The fourth *gurudharma* is: “After having learned the precepts [for two years], a *śikṣamāṇā* should take the full ordination (*upasampadā*) from the Bhikṣu Saṃgha.”(5)

**d. Chinese Sarvāstivāda Vinaya**

The second *gurudharma* is: “A *bhikṣuṇī* should take full ordination from the Bhikṣu Saṃgha.”(6)

In this case, *bhikṣus* of the Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya tradition alone could conduct the *bhikṣuṇī* ordination.

- a. The advantage of this procedure is that it is simple and does not require the involvement of other Buddhist traditions.
- b. The disadvantage of this procedure is that the Vinaya sources do not specify that *bhikṣuṇīs* can be ordained by *bhikṣus* alone. Furthermore, this procedure may be criticized as being incomplete by later generations, just like the first ordination of Chinese *bhikṣuṇīs* in 357 C.E.

## 2. *Bhikṣuṇī* Ordination by a Dual Saṃgha of Dharmagupta *Bhikṣuṇīs* and Mūlasarvāstivāda *Bhikṣus*

### a. Pāli Theravāda Vinaya

- i. The sixth *gurudharma* is, “When, as a probationer, she has trained in the six [*sikkhamānā*] rules for two years, she should seek the ordination from both Saṅghas.”(7)
- ii. The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikṣuṇīs*.(8)

### b. Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya

#### Tibetan

The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikṣuṇīs*. The Blessed One said, “Because Mahāprajāpatī and the other 500 Śākya women accepted the eight *gurudharmas*, they went forth and took full ordination; thus, they became *bhikṣuṇīs*. The other women need to be ordained gradually.”(9) It follows the *karmavacana*, i.e., the procedure in which a woman becomes a Buddhist, an *upāsikā*, and a monastic, including the gradual stages of ordination up to *bhikṣuṇī*. First, she is given the [basic] *brahmacharya* precept by a Saṃgha of at least 12 *bhikṣuṇīs*, followed by ordination by two Saṃghas: a *Bhikṣuṇī* Saṃgha of at least twelve *bhikṣuṇīs* and a *Bhikṣu* Saṃgha of at least ten *bhikṣus*, in front of a *karmakāraka* who is a *bhikṣu*, by stating the name of her abbess (*upādhyāyikā*), etc.(10)

#### Sanskrit

Same as above.(11)

#### Chinese

The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikṣuṇīs*.(12) Mahāprajāpatī accepted the eight *gurudharmas* together with 500 women. After that, the Elder Upāli asked the Buddha, and the Buddha said, “Mahāprajāpatī accepted the eight *gurudharmas* as her going forth and as her full *bhikṣuṇī* ordination. What about other women? How shall they go about it?” And the Buddha said, “After this, the women should follow the sequence, according to the Dharma, to go forth and receive ordination.”

But the women did not understand what was meant by “go in sequence,” so they asked the Buddha. And the Buddha said, “Mahāprajāpatī, as the head and together with the 500 Sakya women, accepted the eight *gurudharmas* and, in that way, went forth and became fully ordained as *bhikṣuṇīs*. After that, the other women who seek to go forth should do likewise and follow the sequence. If a woman wants to go forth, she should go to a *bhikṣuṇī*, pay respect to her, and that *bhikṣuṇī* should ask her whether there are any hindrances. If there are no hindrances, she should accept her, give her three refuges and the five precepts. [There follows an explanation of the three refuges, five precepts] Eventually, she gives her full *bhikṣuṇī* ordination.(13)

**e. Chinese Mahīśāsaka Vinaya**

i. The fourth *gurudharma* is: “A *śikṣamāṇā*, after learning the precepts, should take full ordination from both Saṃghas.”(14) Mahāprajāpatī was ordained by receiving the eight *gurudharmas*. After her, the next group of nuns was ordained by Mahāprajāpatī together with ten *bhikṣus*.

ii. The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikṣuṇīs*.(15)

**f. Chinese Mahāsāṃghika Vinaya**

i. The second *gurudharma* is: “After two years of learning the [*śikṣamāṇā*] precepts, a *bhikṣuṇī* should take full ordination from both Saṃghas.”(16)

ii. The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikṣuṇīs*.(17)

**g. Chinese Sarvāstivāda Vinaya**

The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikṣuṇīs*.(18)

**h. Chinese Theravāda Vinaya**

i. The sixth *gurudharma* is: “After a *sikkhamāṇā* has trained in the six rules for two years, she should seek ordination from both Saṃghas.”(19)

ii. The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikkhuṇīs*.(20)

**i. Chinese Dharmagupta Vinaya**

The dual ordination procedure is prescribed for *bhikṣuṇīs*.(21).

In this case, ten Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda *bhikṣus* could conduct an ordination together with twelve Dharmagupta *bhikṣuṇīs*. The *bhikṣuṇī* ordination rite could be recited in Tibetan, either using the *bhikṣuṇī* dual ordination manual that has been translated from Chinese to Tibetan, or an ordination procedure compiled by Tibetan *bhikṣus* based on Tibetan sources. In the Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya, the *bhikṣuṇīs* are ordained by twelve *bhikṣuṇīs* first, i.e. the *Bhikṣuṇī* Saṃgha transmits to the candidate the *brahmacaryopasthāna* vow.(22) Then ten *bhikṣus* join the twelve *bhikṣuṇīs* together to conduct the final *bhikṣuṇī* ordination rite. Because the eight *pārājikas* and the three reliances, etc., are recited only by the *bhikṣus*, and are the same in the Dharmagupta and Mūlasarvāstivāda, the candidates can be said to receive the Mūlasarvāstivāda precepts.

**B. Question: To transmit the precepts, one must have those precepts oneself or have precepts that are higher than those. Is the Bhikṣu Saṃgha alone, then, allowed to transmit the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts?**

Yes, because the *bhikṣu* precepts are either considered to be higher than the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts or to be of one nature (*ngo bo gcig; ekabhāva*) with the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts. This is so because:

1. It is said that if a *bhikṣu* transforms into a female, then that *bhikṣu* automatically has the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts and does not need to receive ordination again. Similarly, if a *bhikṣuṇī* transforms into a male, he automatically has the *bhikṣu* precepts and does not need to receive them anew. (See addendum on gender transformation, with a translation from the Pāli canon, Vin. III 35, 12-24.) This is a similar passage in the Dharmagupta Vinaya: “At that time, a *bhikṣu* transformed into a female. The *bhikṣus* asked the Buddha, “Should he be expelled [from the Saṃgha]?” The Buddha said, “No, he should not be expelled. He is allowed to be sent to the Bhikṣuṇī Saṃgha, and keeps his *upādhyāya*, his *ācārya* and his previous ordination seniority.”(23)

2. In the Pāli Vinaya, it is said that the Bhikkhu Saṃgha alone ordained the 500 women accompanying Mahāpajāpatī and other women, too. These ordinations were conducted on the advice of the Buddha himself. To transmit these precepts, they did not need to be *bhikkhunīs*. Later, after some women felt embarrassed answering intimate questions in front of *bhikkhus*, the Buddha is said to have instituted the procedure of having *bhikkhunī* masters ask these questions, etc. This is clear from the Pāli Vinaya, considered by historians to be the earliest version of the Vinaya to be written down.

3. At the First Council after the Buddha’s *parinirvāṇa*, Bhikṣu Upāli is said to have recited the whole Vinaya Piṭaka. In this case, he must have recited the *Bhikṣuṇī Prātimokṣa Sūtra*, too. Upāli was not leading the *poṣadha*, but he recited the *Bhikṣuṇī Prātimokṣa Sūtra* as part of the compilation of the Buddha’s teachings. He was allowed to do so, although he did not have the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts. Similarly, the Tibetan *geshe* studies include the study of the Bhikṣuṇī Vinaya.

**C. Question: Is it possible for Tibetan nuns to receive full *bhikṣuṇī* ordination in accordance with the Dharmagupta Vinaya tradition that flourished in China, Korea, Taiwan, Vietnam, etc.?**

Yes. The ordination could be performed by ten *bhikṣus* and ten *bhikṣuṇīs* of the Dharmagupta Vinaya tradition, whether from Taiwan, Korea, Vietnam, or other countries, in accordance with the *bhikṣuṇī upasampadā* rite. In the Dharmagupta Vinaya, the *bhikṣuṇīs* are first ordained by ten *bhikṣuṇīs*. Then these “basic Dharma” *bhikṣuṇīs* (*pen-fa-ni*) and the *bhikṣuṇī* precept master go before an assembly of ten *bhikṣus* on the same day. Such an ordination would be very easy to arrange.

**Bhikṣuṇī Ordination by Dharmagupta Bhikṣus and Dharmagupta Bhikṣuṇīs**

The *bhikṣuṇī* ordination could be performed by *bhikṣus* and *bhikṣuṇīs* of the Dharmagupta tradition in accordance with the *bhikṣuṇī upasampadā* rite. In the Dharmagupta Vinaya, the

*bhikṣuṇīs* are ordained by ten *bhikṣuṇīs* and then go before an assembly of ten *bhikṣus* on the same day.

In this case, nuns of the Tibetan tradition could be ordained by *bhikṣus* and *bhikṣuṇīs* of the Dharmagupta Vinaya tradition. This is the procedure that has been used to reestablish the Bhikṣuṇī Saṃgha in Sri Lanka. The first three groups of Sri Lankan *bhikṣuṇīs* were ordained by *bhikṣus* and *bhikṣuṇīs* of the Chinese or Korean traditions.

Since 1998, ordinations have been conducted by Sri Lankan Theravāda *bhikkhus* together with Sri Lankan *bhikkhuniīs*, in accordance with the Theravāda *bhikkhuni* ordination rite. The Sri Lankan monks made allowances for the newly ordained *bhikkhuniīs* to act as ordination masters due to the special circumstances and because many of these *bhikkhuniīs* had been ordained as ten-precept nuns for 20 or more years. The Sri Lankan *bhikkhuniīs* are now observing the 311 *bhikkhuni* precepts of the Theravāda tradition and are accepted in Sri Lankan society as Theravāda *bhikkhuniīs*. In the same way, nuns of the Tibetan tradition could receive the *bhikṣuṇī* ordination in the Dharmagupta tradition and practice according to the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya. After twelve years, they could perform the *bhikṣuṇī* ordination together with *bhikṣus* of the Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition.

**D. Question: Are there clear records indicating that the *bhikṣu* and *bhikṣuṇī* lineages exist unbroken in East Asia?**

Yes. Attached are texts documenting that: (1) the Chinese *bhikṣu* lineage that flourished in East Asia can be traced to Buddha Śākyamuni himself;(24) and (2) the *bhikṣuṇī* lineage can be traced to the first Chinese *bhikṣuṇī* Ching Chien (Jing-jian) in 357 C.E. Texts documenting both of these lineages are enclosed herewith.(25)

The Chinese master Dao-hai (Tao-hai) asserts that “In a word, the lineage of *bhikṣuṇī* ordination in China has clearly been broken (to receive base rules from a saṃgha consisting of *bhikṣuṇīs* only, not to mention receiving 1-group ordination from *bhikṣus*) during Sung Dynasty (around A.D. 972).”(26) This assertion is refuted by clear documentation. During the Northern Sung dynasty, Emperor T’ai-tsu (Tai-zu) began a persecution of Buddhism and prohibited *bhikṣuṇīs* from traveling to *bhikṣu* monasteries to receive ordination. However, this prohibition was not in effect for long. After Emperor T’ai-tsu (Tai-zu) died in 976, his son T’ai-tsong (Tai-zong) came to power and was well disposed toward Buddhism.(27) This can be proven from historical records documenting that T’ai-tsong (Tai-zong) established an ordination platform in the year 978. Additional ordination platforms were erected in 980, 1001, 1009, and 1010.(28) The year 1010 was especially important, because 72 ordination platforms were erected throughout the country. (See attached documents).

**E. Question: How should the *śikṣamāṇā* ordination be performed?**

1. The *śikṣamāṇā* precepts could be given by Dharmagupta *bhikṣuṇīs* according to the Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition, using the *śikṣamāṇā* precepts from the Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition. This is possible because *bhikṣuṇīs* ordained according to the Dharmagupta Vinaya have all the *śikṣamāṇā* precepts as explained in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya. The *śikṣamāṇā* precepts could be explained by the *bhikṣuṇīs* in Tibetan, by using the Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda text.

2. The training of nuns in the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts could be explained to the candidates during these two years of *śikṣamāṇā* training, because *śikṣamāṇās* are permitted to study the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts. The training of nuns in the *śikṣamāṇā* precepts for two years could be done in one of three ways:

a. Training in India or Nepal

*Bhikṣuṇīs* from Taiwan, Korea, and other countries can assist with the training of candidates in India and Nepal.

b. Training in Taiwan, Korea, or Vietnam

The advantage of this option is that the candidates would get excellent training in monastic discipline and get the experience of living with senior *bhikṣuṇīs*. The disadvantage is that many of the candidates for *bhikṣuṇī* ordination in the Tibetan tradition are in the midst of an intensive education program. It would be an interruption to have these candidates go to Taiwan or elsewhere to train in the precepts. Furthermore, the training is conducted in an unfamiliar language and culture.

c. Tibetan *bhikṣus* could also teach the *śikṣamāṇā* precepts, based on the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya.

3. It is clear in the texts of all Vinaya traditions that the *śramaṇerikā* and *śikṣamāṇā* precepts are to be given by *bhikṣuṇīs*. The training of nuns in the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts could be explained to the candidates during these two years of *śikṣamāṇā* training, because *śikṣamāṇās* are permitted to study the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts. According to the Dharmagupta Vinaya, a *śikṣamāṇā* has to study the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts for two years.(29).

This training could be conducted in two ways:

a. Tibetan *bhikṣus* could teach the *Bhikṣuṇī Pratimoksa* according to the Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition.

b. *Bhikṣuṇīs* of the Chinese, Korean, or other countries could be invited to explain the *bhikṣuṇī* precepts, using both the Dharmagupta and Mūlasarvāstivāda texts.

4. Exceptions with regard to *śikṣamāṇā* ordination are possible under certain circumstances. In Kunkhyen Tsonaba Sherab Zangpo's *Dulwa Tsoṭik*,(30) in the context of the two-year training of a *śikṣamāṇā*, it says that a *śikṣamāṇā* needs to take the precepts "from an *upādhyāyikā* and *karmakārikā*, together with a *saṃgha* of *bhikṣuṇīs*. The female *saṃgha* must be comprised of twelve *bhikṣuṇīs* in a "central land." In a "border land," where twelve *bhikṣuṇīs* are not available, six *bhikṣuṇīs* need to be present. If this number of *bhikṣuṇīs* is not complete and the precepts are given by a community of four *bhikṣuṇīs*, the precepts are said to arise, although those who conduct the ordination commit a fault (*nyes byas*; *duṣkrta*). The same text says, "If one cannot find the required *bhikṣuṇīs*, it is even permissible for the *Bhikṣu Saṃgha* to give the *śikṣamāṇā* precepts (*dge slong ma de dag ma rnyed na/ dge slong pha'i dge 'dun gyis kyang dge slob ma'i bslab pa sbyin du rung ste*)."(31)

## **F. Question: Is there one *bhikṣuṇī* lineage in China or two?**

There is one *bhikṣuṇī* lineage in the Dharmagupta tradition, not two.

In 357 CE, Ching Chien (Jing-jian) was ordained as a *bhikṣuṇī* by *bhikṣus* alone, because there were no *bhikṣuṇīs* in China at that time. Chinese Buddhists traditionally regard this as the beginning of the *bhikṣuṇī* ordination in China. After the arrival of *Bhikṣuṇī* Devasara and other *bhikṣuṇīs* from Sri Lanka, Hui-kuo (Hui-guo) and other Chinese *bhikṣuṇīs* were re-ordained by both *bhikṣus* and *bhikṣuṇīs*, in a ceremony led by the *bhikṣu* master Saṃghavarman and the *bhikṣuṇī* master Devasara (Pāli. Tessara, Chin. Tieh-so-lo) in 434 C.E.

Although the ordination of *bhikṣuṇīs* by *bhikṣus* only is a flawed procedure, it is considered valid. Even the senior Vinaya master Dao Hai (Tao-hai), who is concerned about the state of Vinaya practice in general these days, agrees that a *bhikṣuṇī* ordination by *bhikṣus* alone is valid, even though the *bhikṣus* who conduct such an ordination commit a minor transgression. The Dharmagupta Vinaya Piṭaka source for the ordination of *bhikṣuṇīs* by *bhikṣus* alone is the fourth *gurudharma*, as explained above. This is equivalent to the first *gurudharma* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya. As mentioned by *Bhikṣu* Dao Hai (Tao-hai), the fourth-century Vinaya master Gunavarman and the seventh-century Dharmagupta master Tao-Hsuan (Tao-xuan) agreed that a *bhikṣuṇī* ordination by *bhikṣus* alone is valid.(32)

The lineage that began with Ching Chien (Jing-jian) was strengthened through the re-ordination of the *bhikṣuṇīs* by a dual ordination ceremony conducted in 434 C.E by *bhikṣuṇīs* from Sri Lanka, together with Chinese *bhikṣus*, headed by Saṃghavarman. This was done to remove the doubts of the nuns who had earlier been ordained by *bhikṣus* alone and who questioned whether the ordination they had received from *bhikṣus* only was sufficient. The history of how the *bhikṣuṇī* lineage, starting with Mahāprajāpatī, was transmitted from India to Sri Lanka by King Asoka's daughter Saṃghamittā, and was then transmitted by Devasara and eleven other *bhikṣuṇīs* from Sri Lanka to China, is well documented and can be requested from the Board of Sri Lanka Bhikkhunī Order.

At present, in East Asia, when a *bhikṣuṇī* is invited to serve as a *bhikṣuṇī* ordination master, she is not asked whether she was ordained in a single or a dual ordination ceremony. Both types of ordination are considered valid. Thus, there is only one lineage of *bhikṣuṇī* ordination, not two.

## **G. Question: Are Documents Available that Record of the Lineage of the Dharmagupta *Bhikṣuṇī* Vinaya?**

The *bhikṣu* lineage in China can be documented all the way back to the Buddha. The *bhikṣuṇī* lineage in China can be documented from the time of Ching Chien (Jing-jian), the first Chinese *bhikṣuṇī*, in 357 C.E. The text that documents the *bhikṣu* lineage back to the time of Buddha Śākyamuni is enclosed herewith. The text that documents the *bhikṣuṇī* lineage in China from the time of the first Chinese *bhikṣuṇīs* up to the present day is also enclosed herewith.

Vinaya sources documenting the validity of the Dharmagupta *bhikṣuṇī* ordination are provided above, including (1) *bhikṣuṇī* ordination by *bhikṣus* alone, and (2) *bhikṣuṇī* ordination by a dual Saṃgha of *bhikṣuṇīs* and *bhikṣus* (see pp. 1-3 of this paper).

## H. Question: Are bhikshuni ordination ceremonies as conducted in East Asia done in compliance with instructions set out in the Dharmaguptaka Vinaya?

1. In the *bhikṣuṇī* ordination ceremonies that are held in Taiwan, nuns are ordained in groups of three, not in groups of one or two hundred. There are numerous candidates, who are divided into groups of three, just as in the Tibetan tradition, which is why the ordination ceremony takes a long time. The procedure is conducted in accordance with the full *bhikṣuṇī* ordination rite as given in the Vinaya texts. The newly ordained *bhikṣuṇīs* are individually informed three by three of the exact time of their ordination, to determine their seniority. To know who is senior to oneself is considered very important in daily life in the Chinese, Korean, Taiwanese, and Vietnamese traditions. *Bhikṣus* and *bhikṣuṇīs* are keenly aware of monastic seniority, and stand, walk, and sit according to seniority, as determined by the time of their ordination.

2. The Sanskrit term *paṭhati* (Tib. *‘don pa*, Chin. *nien/nian*) actually has two meanings: “to read (aloud)” and “to recite (aloud).” The word may be interpreted in both ways, to recite by heart or to read aloud from a text. In Chinese, “to recite *sūtras*” is usually “*nien ching (nian-jing)*” and, like the Sanskrit, may refer to both “reading aloud (from a text)” or “reciting aloud (by heart).” In Tibetan, “to recite the *Prātimokṣa Sūtra* is “*so sor thar pa’i mdo ‘don pa*; in Chinese, *sou po-lo-ti-mu-chai* or *sung po-lo-ti-mu-chai* (both *sou* and *sung* mean to read aloud).

The discrepancy between the practice in early times and today is easy to explain. It is true that, at the time of the Buddha and when the Vinaya texts were compiled, writing was not common in society. Therefore, the texts were transmitted orally, by memory, at that time. In modern Taiwan, it is considered appropriate for the precept master to read certain parts of the ritual aloud during the ordination procedure, although the candidates must learn the rituals by heart and are not allowed to rely on any texts during the rite. They either recite the appropriate sections of the text by heart or repeat them after the master. Learning portions of the texts by heart is an integral part of the preparation of candidates during the thirty or forty-five days of the Triple Platform Ordination Ceremony. Western candidates for *bhikṣuṇī* ordination are also asked to learn certain parts of the rite (for example, the questions about the hindrances) by heart.

## Conclusion

It is clear that a living lineage of *bhikṣuṇīs* exists today, with over 58,000 *bhikṣuṇīs* in China, Korea, Taiwan, Vietnam, and elsewhere. This lineage dates back to Buddha Śākyamuni and the first nun, Mahāprajāpatī. The lineage was transmitted from India to Sri Lanka by Saṃghamittā, and then from Sri Lanka to China by Devasara, where it merged with the already existing lineage of *bhikṣuṇīs* who had been ordained by *bhikṣus* only. The lineage then flourished in China and was transmitted from there to Korea, Taiwan, Vietnam, and other countries. Although it is true that not every *bhikṣuṇī* ordination has been performed in a dual ordination procedure, it is an indisputable fact that the Chinese *bhikṣuṇī* lineage has continued unbroken and flourished until the present day. Therefore, there exists no obstacle to conducting a *bhikṣuṇī* ordination for nuns in the Tibetan tradition.

## NOTES

1. Cullavagga X.2.1 (Vin II 257,79). For a complete list of the references for these eight *gurudharmas* in the different renditions of the Vinaya and a table of their different order and deviations see, Jin-il Chung, “Gurudharma und Aṣṭau Gurudharmāḥ,” *Indo-Iranian Journal* 42 (1999), pp. 227-34.

2. *Bla ma'i chos brgyad* (also known as: *lCi ba'i chos brgyad*). Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya, Lhasa Kangyur, Delhi, ‘Dul ba, vol. Da (11), p. 154a5-7: *dge slong rnam las bud med rnams kyis rab tu 'byung ba dang/ bsnyen par rdzogs nas/ dge slong ma'i dngos por 'gyur ba rab tu rtogs par bya'o/ kun dga' bo ngas 'di ni/ bud med rnams kyi nyes pa dgag cing mi 'da' bar bya ba'i phyir/ bla ma'i chos dang por bcas te/ de la bud med rnams kyis nam 'tsho'i bar du bslab par bya'o/ll*. Same in Peking Kangyur, ‘Dul ba, vol. Ne 99b-101b, p. 162, folio 99b1-2 ff.

3. A partial English translation is found in Diana Paul, *Women in Buddhism*, p. 85. “In the presence of monks, O Ānanda, women are expected to request ordination to go forth as nuns. I announce this as the first important rule for women to overcome the obstructions, so that instruction can be maintained throughout life.” This translation is based on C. M. Ridding and Louis de la Vallée Poussin, “A Fragment of the Sanskrit Vinaya. Bhikṣuṇīkarmavacana,” *Bulletin of the School of Oriental Studies* 1:3(1920) 123-43. Cf. Michael Schmidt, “Bhikṣuṇī-Karmavacana. Die Handschrift Sansk. c.25(R) der Bodlein Library Oxford,” in *Studien zur Indologie und Buddhismuskunde. Festgabe des Seminars für Indologie und Buddhismuskunde für Prof. Dr. Heinz Bechert zum 60. Geburtstag am 26. Juni 1992* (Bonn: Indica et Tibetica, 1993, pp. 239-88). The corresponding first *gurudharma* in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Sanskrit text BhiKaVa(S), folio 4b5-5a1, reads: *bhikṣubhyaḥ śakāsād ānanda mātrgrāmeṇa pravrajyopasampad bhikṣuṇībhāvaḥ pratikāṃkṣitavya imam aham ānanda mātrgrāmasya prathamam gurudharmmam prajñapayāmy āvaraṇāyānatikrama (5a1) (ṇ)āya yatra mātrgrāmeṇa yāvajjīvaṃ śikṣā karaṇīyā*. Cf. Michael Schmidt, “Zur Schulzugehörigkeit einer nepalesischen Handschrift der Bhikṣuṇī-Karmavacana,” in *Untersuchungen zur buddhistischen Literatur* (Sanskrit-Wörterbuch der buddhistischen Texte aus den Turfan-Funden, Beiheft 5) (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1994).

4. The texts of six schools of Vinaya are found in Chinese translation: Dharmagupta, Mahīśāsaka, Mahāsāṃghika, Theravāda, Sarvāstivāda, and Mūlasarvāstivāda. Mūlasarvāstivāda: Taisho 24, T.1451, p. 351b, line 19. “A *bhikṣuṇī* should request going forth and full ordination to become the nature of a *bhikṣuṇī* from the *bhikṣus*.”

5. Dharmagupta: Taisho 22, T.1428 , 923b, line 8.

6. Sarvāstivādaastivada: Taisho 23, T. 1435, p. 345c.

7. Cullavagga X, I. B. Horner, *The Book of the Discipline*, vol. 5, p. 355.

8. Cullavagga X, I.B. Horner, *The Book of the Discipline*, vol. 5, pp.375-379.

9. Lhasa Kangyur, Vol. Da [11] p. 158a6-7 *bcom ldan 'das kyis bka' stsal pa/ go'u ta mi skye dgu'i bdag mo chen mo la sogs pa shākya mo lnga brgya rnams ni/ bla ma'i chos rnams khas*

*blangs pas/ rab tu byung zhing bsnyen par rdzogs te/ dge slong ma' dngos por gyur to/ bud med gzhan ni rim bzhin bya stel.*

10. Ibid., p. pp. 158a7-181a4.

11. Paul, *Women in Buddhism*, p. 86-94.

12. T.24, p.459c, line 10 through p.465a, line 20.

13. Mūlasarvāstivāda: Taisho 24, p. 351c.

14. Dharmagupta: Taisho 22, T. p. 185b.

15. T.22, p.218b, line 9.

16. Taisho 22, T.1425, p. 474.

17. T.22, p.471b, line 12.

18. T.23, p.331b, line15.

19. Nan-chuan Da-tsang Ching, vol.4, p.341.

20. Nan-chuan Da-tsang Ching, vol.4, p.360-364.

21. T22. p.1065b, line 11.

22. Tib. *tshangs spyod nyer gnas kyi sdom pa.*

23. T22, p. 813b, line 15.

24. *Lu-tsung t'e-pu* (The Lineage of the Vinaya School), compiled by Yuan-liang during the Ching (Qing) Dynasty (Taipei: Hsin-wen-fong Publications, 1987).

25. *Complete Records of the Biographies of Bhiksunis* (Taipei: Fo-chiao Publications, 1988). This work includes two compilations: (1) *Pi-chiu-ni chuan* (The Biographies of Bhikṣuṇīs), compiled by Pao-chiang in the sixth century, and (2) *Hsu Pi-chiu-ni chuan* (The Sequel Biographies of Bhikṣuṇīs), compiled by Chen-hua (1911-).

26. See Bhikkhu Tao-hai, "Discussion of Bhikṣuṇī Ordination and Its Lineage in China: Based on Scriptures of Chinese Vinaya and Historical Facts," Paper given at the Vinaya conference held in Dharamsala in 1998, pp. 17-18.

27. Heng-ching Shih, "Lineage and Transmission: Integrating the Chinese and Tibetan Orders of Buddhist Nuns," *Chung-hwa Buddhist Journal I*, No.13 (2000): 529-31.

28. Sik Chien-yi, *Three Chapters on the Refreshing Sound of the Dharma: The Collective Essays of the "Re-Ordination of Nun,"* (Nantou: Dakinava Press, 2002), p. 13.

29. T.22, p. 1048c, line 8.

30. Tibetan commentary '*Dul ba mtsho tik*, by mTso sna ba shes rab bzang po (b. 13th cent.). The full title of the text is, '*Dul ba mdo rtsa'i 'grel pa legs bshad nyi ma'i 'od zer* (TBRC Code W12567). Vol. Ka (1), p. 120a4-5.

31. Vol. Ka (1), p. 120a5-6.

32. Ibid., p. 6.